Medical student selection – how good are we?

Ian Wilson
When was this statement made?

1. Selection should not be based solely on examination results
2. All candidates should be interviewed, preferably by a small committee
3. Great attention should be given to reports from headmasters and headmistresses
4. The machinery of for selection should be supplemented by adequate arrangements for weeding out failures in the early part of training
When was this statement made?

1. Selection should not be based solely on examination results
2. All candidates should be interviewed, preferably by a small committee
3. Great attention should be given to reports from headmasters and headmistresses
4. The machinery of for selection should be supplemented by adequate arrangements for weeding out failures in the early part of training

So how far have we come?

• Academic results
  • Matriculation scores or GPA
  • MCAT, GAMSAT, etc

• Interviews
  • Panel
  • MMI

• School reports
  • Mostly abandoned

• Weeding out failures
  • Poorly done
What else?

• Situational judgment test
  • Paper
  • Online

• Personality
  • NEO
  • Personal Qualities Assessment

• Rurality
  • Definition
  • Portfolio
  • Quota
What else?

• Underrepresented minorities
  • UMAT, SJT
  • Special selection pathways
  • Quotas
• Prescribed prior course
• Common first year program for health students
Unresolved issues

• Professionalism
• Resilience
• Mental stability/ health
• Commercialisation of the process
• Preparation industry
• Community interest / concern
Professionalism

- Definition
- Inherent, personal quality?
- Teachable?
- Do SJTs or MMIs measure professionalism?
- Can professionalism be faked?
- Impression management
Resilience

• Difficult issue in Australia
• How do you measure resilience?
• Is resilience context specific?
Mental stability and health

• Background
  • “Only the best”
  • Inherent requirements

• If it is ethical to do this
  • How to screen and/or detect
  • How to deal with episodic/recurrent illness

Signs of a Sociopath

• Superficial charm
• Untruthful & Manipulative
• Egocentric
• Devoid of remorse or empathy
• Seeks to dominate and win at all costs
• Never apologizes
• Expert story tellers
• Presents themselves as a hero-with high morals and philosophy
• Incites emotional chaos
• Feigns like or love to get what they want
Commercialisation of selection

• Is commercialisation a bad thing?
• Does commercialisation promote quality processes?
Community involvement

- Adelaide
- Netherlands
- Ireland
- Tamil Nadu
We now have

• International **Network for Research in Selection for Health**
  • INReSH

• Second International Selection in the Health Professions Conference
  • Melbourne 11-13 April 2018
My view

• We have achieved much and selection is significantly better than it was

• Selection will continue to improve

• “The machinery of for selection should be supplemented by adequate arrangements for weeding out failures in the early part of training” will still be required
THANK YOU FOR LISTENING MY PRESENTATION